**CORPORATE CONSUMERS GRIEVANCES REDRESSAL FORUM**

**PUNJAB STATE POWER COPROPRATION LIMITED**

**220 KV S/Stn. Opp. Verka Milk Plant, Ferozepur Road, Ludhiana**

**Tel: 0161-2971912, email: secy.cgrfldh@gmail.com**

**CASE NO.: CF-135/2023**

**Date of Registration : 10.10.2023**

**Date of Closing : 17.10.2023**

**Date of Final Order : 19.10.2023**

**In the Matter of:**

**Sh. Arwinder Singh, Khem Singh,**

**Chaura Bazar, AK MKT,**

**Ludhiana.**

**A/c No.: 3002804297.**

**Through:**

Sh. Arwinder Singh  **...Petitioner**

**Versus**

**Punjab State Power Corporation Ltd**

**Through:**

Sr. Xen/Op. City Central (Spl.) Divn.,

PSPCL, Ludhiana. **...Respondent**

1. **BRIEF HISTORY:**

Petition against case No.: CF-135/2023 has been filed in the Forum by the petitioner as appeal against the decision dated 26.04.2023 of City East Circle CGRF, Ludhiana in the matter related to A/c no. 3002804297, in the name of Sh. Arwinder Singh. The Petitioner is having NRS connection with Sanctioned Load 10.960 KW under DS City Central (Spl.) Division, PSPCL, Ludhiana. Petitioner was issued bill dated 09.11.2022 for the period of 56 days from 14.09.2022 to 09.11.2022 on O-code for a consumption of 16398 KWH amounting to Rs. 138810/-. Petitioner did not agree to this bill and on suspicion that his meter was running fast, he challenged his meter. Site of the petitioner was checked vide LCR no. 64/2123 dated 10.11.2022 when load of 3.960 KW was found connected and reading of the meter was recorded as 26287 KWH. Meter of the petitioner was changed vide MCO no. 100019809989 dated 16.11.2022 effected on 07.12.2022. Removed meter was checked in ME Lab vide challan no. 1682 dated 21.12.2022 where meter was reported within accuracy limits on KWH mode; DDL was taken on MRI. Petitioner did not agree with the results of ME Lab and filed his case in City East Circle CGRF, Ludhiana where it was decided on 26.04.2023 that this is a case of accumulation of reading hence the amount charged is correct & recoverable.

Petitioner, not satisfied with the decision dated 26.04.2023 of City East Circle CGRF, Ludhiana filed his appeal in Corporate CGRF, Ludhiana. Forum heard the case in its proceedings dated 10.10.2023 and finally on 17.10.2023, when the case was closed for passing speaking orders.

1. ***PROCEEDINGS:***

***Proceedings dated: 10.10.2023***

*The petition has been placed before the Forum for admission. After considering the averments made in the petition, the petition is admitted. Notice be issued to ASE/Sr. Xen/Op. City central Ludhiana (Respondent) along with copy of petition.*

*Respondent shall submit five copies of the following record/documents before the Forum*

1. *Respondent shall confirm that there is no case pending before any Court/Forum or any other authority between PSPCL and Petitioner.*
2. *Respondent shall confirm the status of up to date payments and shall ensure that no bill other than the amount in dispute, is pending.*
3. *Respondent shall confirm that the complainant/applicant/petitioner is a competent/authorised person to file/defend the case on behalf of the consumer of the above a/c no.*
4. *Respondent shall also ensure the following action: -*
   1. *He will submit point-wise/para-wise reply to the petition be submitted in form of hard copy & soft copy (in word format) through email at* [*secy.cgrfldh@gmail.com*](mailto:secy.cgrfldh@gmail.com)
   2. *He will check/verify the bill dated 09.11.2022 amounting Rs, 138810/- for a consumption of 16398KWH for period 14.09.2022 to 09.11.2022.*
   3. *He will submit copy of case file of Circle CGRF and its decision.*
   4. *He will submit screenshots of meter taken before 09/2022, consumption data depicting readings, dates of reading (in KWH & KVAH, MDI, PF etc.) also indicating the meter status, MF etc. For previous 5 years along with SAP reading record.*
   5. *He will submit copy of current site checking report and further submit copies of reports of checking carried out by various authorities previously.*
   6. *Submit copies of related Job order clearly depicting date of effect thereof, ME lab reports of meter in dispute alongwith its DDL.*
   7. *Intimate Regulation number of Supply Code, 2014 or any other relevant Rules/Regulations according to which the amount has been charged.*
   8. *Ensure that all the documents have been checked/verified & signed by ASE/Sr. XEN and he will be responsible for the authenticity of the documents/information submitted to the Forum.*

*The case be put up on 17.10.2023*

***Proceedings dated: 17.10.2023***

*Respondent submitted five sets of reply to the petition and the same is taken on record. One copy handed over to the petitioner.*

*Petitioner stated that he is satisfied with the consumption recorded by new meter in the year 2023.*

*Petitioner/PR stated that the petition, rejoinder and other documents already submitted may also be considered as part of oral discussion.*

*Respondent stated that the reply to the petition and other documents already submitted may be considered as oral discussion*

*Both the parties have nothing more to say and submit.*

*The case is closed for passing speaking orders.*

1. **FACTS OF THE CASE AND OBSERVATIONS OF THE FORUM: -**
2. The Petitioner bearing A/c no. 3002804297, is having NRS connection with sanctioned Load of 10.960 KW, in the name of Sh. Arwinder Singh, under DS City Central Division, Ludhiana.
3. The Petitioner in his Petition prayed that: -

*In 11/2022, I received bill of Rs. 138810/- in Nov, 2022. Meter was changed by PSPCL. Then I move an application in Circle office but matter has not resolved and decision not given in my favor. I request you to correct my bill. Please accept the delay in filling the case because decision was personally collected by me from office.*

1. The Respondent submitted reply to the petition as under: -

*ਖਪਤਕਾਰ ਨੂੰ ਮਹੀਨਾ 11/22 ਵਿੱਚ 16398 KWH ਰੀਡਿੰਗ ਤੇ 138810/- ਰੁਪਏ ਦਾ ਬਿੱਲ ਜਾਰੀ ਹੋਇਆ। ਖਪਤਕਾਰ ਵੱਲੋਂ ਆਪਣਾ ਮੀਟਰ ਤੇਜ ਚੱਲਦਾ ਸਮਝਦੇ ਹੋਏ ਮੀਟਰ ਚੇਲੰਜ ਕਰਵਾਉਣ ਲਈ ਪ੍ਰਤੀਵੇਦਨਾ ਦਿੱਤੀ। ਖਪਤਕਾਰ ਦਾ ਮੀਟਰ ਜੇਈ ਵੱਲੋ ਐਲ.ਸੀ.ਆਰ. ਨੰ. 64/2123 ਮਿਤੀ 10,11.2022 ਨੂੰ ਚੈਕ ਕੀਤਾ ਗਿਆ ਅਤੇ KWH ਰੀਡਿੰਗ 26287 ਰਿਕਾਰਡ ਕੀਤੀ ਅਤੇ ਚੱਲਦਾ ਲੋਡ 3.960 ਕਿਲੋਵਾਟ ਰਿਕਾਰਡ ਕੀਤਾ। ਖਪਤਕਾਰ ਦਾ ਮੀਟਰ ਐਮ.ਸੀ.ਓ. ਨੰ. 100019809989 ਮਿਤੀ 16.11.2022 ਨਾਲ ਮਿਤੀ 07.12.2022 ਨੂੰ ਬਦਲਿਆ ਗਿਆ ਉਤਾਰਿਆ ਮੀਟਰ ਸਟੋਰ ਚਲਾਨ ਨੰ. 1682 ਮਿਤੀ 21/12/22, ਨਾਲ ਚੈਕ ਕੀਤਾ ਗਿਆ ਅਤੇ ਮੀਟਰ ਦੀ KWH ਮੋੜ ਤੇ ਐਕੂਰੇਸੀ ਸੀਮਾ ਵਿੱਚ ਹੈ ਡੀ.ਡੀ.ਐਲ. ਸੀ.ਐਮ.ਆਰ.ਆਈ. ਤੇ ਲੈ ਲਿਆ ਗਿਆ ਲਿਖਿਆ ਗਿਆ। ਜਿਸ ਤੋਂ ਸਹਿਮਤ ਨਾਂ ਹੁੰਦੇ ਹੋਏ ਖਪਤਕਾਰ ਵੱਲੋਂ ਆਪਣਾ ਕੇਸ ਸਰਕਲ ਖਪਤਕਾਰ ਸ਼ਿਕਾਇਤ ਨਿਵਾਰਨ ਫੋਰਮ ਵਿੱਚ ਲਗਾਉਣ ਸੰਬੰਧੀ ਪ੍ਰਤੀਵੇਦਨਾ ਦਿੱਤੀ ਗਈ ਜਿਸਦਾ ਫੈਸਲਾ ਮਿਤੀ 26.04.2023 ਨੂੰ ਸੁਣਾਇਆ ਗਿਆ ਅਤੇ ਇਸ ਫੈਸਲੇ ਅਨੁਸਾਰ ਖਪਤਕਾਰ ਨੂੰ ਚਾਰਜ ਕੀਤੀ ਗਈ ਰਕਮ ਸਹੀ ਅਤੇ ਵਸੂਲਣਯੋਗ ਪਾਈ ਗਈ (ਫੈਸਲੇ ਦੀ ਕਾਪੀ ਨੱਥੀ)। ਪਰ ਖਪਤਕਾਰ ਇਸ ਨਾਲ ਸਹਿਮਤ ਨਹੀਂ ਹੋਇਆ ਅਤੇ ਆਪਣਾ ਕੇਸ CORPORATE CGRF ਵਿੱਚ ਲਗਾਉਣ ਪ੍ਰਤੀਵੇਦਨਾ ਦਿੱਤੀ। ਕੇਸ ਸਬੰਧੀ ਦਸਤਾਵੇਜ ਅਗਲੇਰੀ ਕਾਰਵਾਈ ਹਿੱਤ ਪੇਸ਼ ਹੈ ਜੀ।*

1. Forum have gone through the written submissions made by the Petitioner in the petition, written reply of the Respondent oral discussions made by Petitioner along with material brought on record. The issue that requires adjudication in the present case is to decide the legitimacy of decision dated 26.04.2023 of City East Circle CGRF, PSPCL, Ludhiana vide which amount of Rs. 138810/- charged to petitioner in bill dated 09.11.2022 was held correct and recoverable.
2. Forum observed that Petitioner was issued bill dated 09.11.2022 for the period of 56 days from 14.09.2022 to 09.11.2022 on O-code for a consumption of 16398 KWH amounting to Rs. 138810/-. Petitioner did not agree to this bill and on suspicion that his meter was running fast, he challenged his meter. Site of the petitioner was checked vide LCR no. 64/2123 dated 10.11.2022 when load of 3.960 KW was found connected and reading of the meter was recorded as 26287 KWH. Meter of the petitioner was changed vide MCO no. 100019809989 dated 16.11.2022 effected on 07.12.2022. Removed meter was checked in ME Lab vide challan no. 1682 dated 21.12.2022 where meter was reported within accuracy limits on KWH mode; DDL was taken on MRI. Petitioner did not agree with the results of ME Lab and filed his case in City East Circle CGRF, Ludhiana where it was decided on 26.04.2023 as under: -

“***ਖਪਤਕਾਰ ਦਾ ਡਾਟਾ ਅਤੇ ਡੀ.ਡੀ.ਐਲ ਵੀ ਘੋਖਿਆ ਗਿਆ। ਡੀ.ਡੀ.ਐਲ ਮੁਤਾਬਿਕ ਮੀਟਰ ਦੇ ਸਹੀ ਹੋਣ ਦੀ ਪੁਸ਼ਟੀ ਹੁੰਦੀ ਹੈ। ਡੀ.ਡੀ.ਐਲ ਘੋਖਣ ਉਪਰੰਤ ਸਪੱਸ਼ਟ ਰੂਪ ਵਿੱਚ ਪਾਇਆ ਗਿਆ ਕਿ ਇਹ ਰੀਡਿੰਗ ਐਕੁਮੂਲੇਸ਼ਨ ਦਾ ਕੇਸ ਹੈ। ਖਪਤਕਾਰ ਨੂੰ ਚਾਰਜ ਕੀਤੀ ਗਈ ਰਕਮ ਸਹੀ ਅਤੇ ਵਸੂਲਣਯੋਗ ਹੈ।***”

Petitioner, not satisfied with the decision dated 26.04.2023 of City East Circle CGRF, Ludhiana filed his appeal in Corporate CGRF, Ludhiana. Forum observed the consumption data of petitioner supplied by the Respondent, which is tabulated under: -

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 2023 | |
| Month | Cons. | Code | Cons. | Code | Cons. | Code | Cons. | Code | Cons. | Code |
| Jan | 619 | O | 560 | O | 436 | O |  |  |  |  |
| Feb | 580 | O |  |  |  | O | 1194 | O | 1308 | O |
| Mar | 578 | O | 646 | O | 521 | O | 1073 | O | 1001 | O |
| Apr | 628 | O | 857 | N | 627 | O |  |  | 1072 | O |
| May | 747 | O | 1014 | N | 655 | O |  |  | 2322 | P |
| June | 1006 | O | 0 | O | 252 | O | 989 | N | 910 | O |
| July | 998 | O | 998 | N | 945 | O | 856 | N | 1492 | O |
| Aug | 1230 | O | 1720 | O | 1564  986 | O  R |  |  | 2312 | O |
| Sept | 1677 | O | 845 | O | 2365 | O | 0 | O | 1876 | O |
| Oct | 1537 | O | 1346 | O | 2278 | O |  |  | 1924 | O |
| Nov | 852 | O | 585 | O | 1223 | O | 16398 | O |  |  |
| Dec | 562  566 | O  O | 556  421 | O  O | 696 | O | 1042  9  830 | O  E  C |  |  |
| **TOTAL** | **11580** |  | **9548** |  | **12548** |  | **22391** |  | **14217** |  |

Forum perused the billing report of the meter available in its DDL report and consumption table placed on the record by the Respondent. Readings depicted in the DDL of the meter vis-a-vis those recorded by the meter reader on different dates during the same period are tabulated below: -

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Readings by Meter Reader** | | **Readings as per meter software** | |
| Date | Reading | Date | Reading |
| 31.12.2021 | 6562 | 01.01.2022 | 6582.75 |
| 04.02.2022 | 7756 | 01.02.2022 | 7613.35 |
| 02.03.2022 | 8829 | 01.03.2022 | 8762.95 |
|  |  | 01.04.2022 | 10323.42 |
|  |  | 01.05.2022 | 12757.35 |
| 16.06.2022 | 9818 (N-code) | 01.06.2022 | 15100.48 |
| 15.07.2022 | 10674 (N-code) | 01.07.2022 | 17061.65 |
|  |  | 01.08.2022 | 19500.03 |
| 14.09.2022 | 9825 | 01.09.2022 | 21777.02 |
|  |  | 01.10.2022 | 24101.44 |
| 09.11.2022 | 26223 | 01.11.2022 | 25864.05 |
|  |  | 01.12.2022 | 27030.74 |
|  |  | 07.12.2022 | 27274.19  (Final reading as per MCO, ME Lab & DDL) |

It can be observed from the above table that meter reader recorded correct readings till 02.03.2022. Thereafter he did not record readings for six months; consequently, no bills were issued to the consumer during April and May 2022. Bills during June and July were issued on N-code. The bill during Sep/2022 was issued with reading as 9825 Kwh of 996 units for 196 days probably just to clear N-code. No bill was issued during October 2022. Thereafter, the meter reader recorded reading of 26223 KWH ultimately. In the DDL report there is no abrupt rise in the consumption during any billing cycle and the accuracy of the meter was found within limits in ME Lab. It is very much clear from the above facts that meter reader was not recording the reading timely and properly and allowed to accumulate the reading. Therefore, this is a clear-cut case of concealment of readings by the meter reader for which punitive action is required to be taken against the meter reader and the agency responsible for recording meter readings.

Forum have gone through the written submissions made by the Petitioner in the petition, written reply of the Respondent, oral discussions made by Petitioner along with material brought on record. Forum is of the opinion that this is clear cut case of accumulation of readings as such there is no need to interfere with the decision dated 26.04.2023 of East City Circle CGRF, PSPCL, Ludhiana. However, necessary action as per terms and conditions of the work order cum contract agreement is required to be taken against the meter reading agency and the concerned meter reader(s). Dy. CE/DS, Circle City East, Ludhiana should take necessary action in this regard.

Keeping in view the above, Forum came to unanimous conclusion that the decision dated 26.04.2023 of East City Circle CGRF, PSPCL, Ludhiana be upheld. Dy. CE/DS, Circle City East, Ludhiana is directed to take necessary action against the meter reading agency and the concerned meter reader(s), as per terms and conditions of the work order cum contract agreement.

1. **DECISION:**

Keeping in view the petition, reply, oral discussion, after hearing both the parties, perusal of the record produced by them & observations of Forum,

Forum decides that: -

1. **The decision dated 26.04.2023 of East City Circle CGRF, PSPCL, Ludhiana is upheld. Dy. CE/DS, Circle City East, Ludhiana is directed to take necessary action against the meter reading agency and the concerned meter reader(s), as per terms and conditions of the work order cum contract agreement.**
2. **As required under Regulation 2.33 of the Punjab State Electricity Regulatory Commission (Forum & Ombudsman) (2nd Amendment) Regulations, 2021 the compliance of this decision shall be made within 21 days from the date of receipt of this order.**
3. **If the Petitioner is not satisfied with the decision of Corporate CGRF, he is at liberty to file a representation before the Ombudsman appointed / designated by the Punjab State Electricity Regulatory Commission within 30 days from the date of receipt of the order of the Forum, as required under Regulation 2.39 read with Regulation 2.37 of the Punjab State Electricity Regulatory Commission (Forum & Ombudsman) (2nd Amendment) Regulations, 2021.**

**(CA. Baneet Kumar Singla) (Er. Himat Singh Dhillon)**

**Member (Finance) Independent Member**

**(Er. Navdeep Singh Chahal) (Er. Kuldeep Singh)**

**Permanent Invitee Chairperson**

**O/o CE/Commercial, PSPCL**

**Place: Ludhiana**

**Date: 19.10.2023**